# Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group MINUTES

# MMWTWG-2022-05 Thursday, November 10, 2022, 7:00 p.m. Via Zoom

Members Present: Mark Davis - Municipality of Arran-Elderslie

Doug Bell - Municipality of Arran-Elderslie

Bill Palmer - Citizen - Municipality of Arran-Elderslie

Steve Adams - Municipality of Brockton

Philip M. Englishman - Citizen - Municipality of Brockton

Alex Westerhout - Municipality of Central Huron

Scott Mackey - Township of Chatsworth

Paul McQueen - Municipality of Grey Highlands Tom Allwood - Municipality of Grey Highlands Randy Roppel - Municipality of Kincardine

Others Present: Julie Hamilton - Recording Secretary

## 1. Meeting Access Details

#### 2. Call to Order

The Chair called the meeting to order at 7:00 pm. A quorum was present.

## 3. Adoption of Agenda

The Working Group passed the following resolution:

#### MMWTWG-2022-39

Moved by: Randy Roppel -

Municipality of Kincardine

**Seconded by:** Philip M. Englishman -

Citizen - - Municipality of

**Brockton** 

Be It Resolved that the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby adopts the agenda of the Thursday, November 10, 2022 as distributed by the Recording Secretary.

**Carried** 

# 4. **Disclosures of Pecuniary Interest and General Nature Thereof**None.

## 5. Minutes of Previous Meetings

#### 5.1 Minutes of the September 8, 2022 meeting

The Working Group passed the following resolution:

MMWTWG-2022-40

**Moved by:** Steve Adams - Municipality

of Brockton

**Seconded by:** Alex Westerhout -

Municipality of Central

Huron

Be It Resolved that the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby approves the minutes of the Thursday, September 8, 2022 meeting as presented by the Recording Secretary.

Carried

# 6. Business Arising from the Minutes

# 6.1 Letter in response to the Ministry of Environment, Conservation and Parks Compliance and Complaint letter

At the September 8th meeting, the Working Group passed a resolution that a letter be drafted and and sent to the Ministry of the Environment, Conservation and Parks, requesting that we receive a quarterly report regarding complaints and the response to those complaints as required by the compliance protocol and that these reports be sent through the Recording Secretary for inclusion in the agenda package. This letter has been completed and sent to the Ministry.

#### 6.2 Letter Re: Wind Turbine Taxation

At the September 8th meeting, the Working Group approved the distribution of a letter to be sent to the Minister of Finance requesting a review of the tax assessment rate assigned to wind turbines by a regulation under the authority of the Minister of Finance. This letter was finalized and has been sent.

# 7. Delegations/Presentations

### 7.1 Wind Turbines defined as A Health Hazard - Ruby Mekker

Ms. Mekker addressed the working group regarding her efforts to clarify if industrial wind turbines are, or should be, recognized as health hazards. She provided in advance of the meeting, the presentation that she made to the Eastern Ontario Health Unit, Board of Health, regarding the health effects that wind turbines have been known to cause in people who reside in the vicinity of sites. She also provided some communications she has had with Wind Concerns Ontario and Robert Lerch, Director, Health Protection and Surveillance Policy and Programs Branch Ontario Ministry of Health.

Ms. Mekker requested that the MMWTWG seek clarification from the Government of Ontario about whether industrial wind turbines are, or should be, considered a "health hazard" as defined by the Health Protection and Promotion Act of Ontario, something "that has or that is likely to have an adverse effect on the health of any person.

The Chair thanked Ms. Mekker for her presentation.

Members of the Working Group offered their past experiences with this avenue.

Subsequent to further discussion, the Working Group passed the following resolution:

#### MMWTWG-2022-41

**Moved by:** Bill Palmer - Citizen -

Municipality of Arran-

Elderslie

**Seconded by:** Randy Roppel -

Municipality of Kincardine

Be It Resolved that the Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby,

- 1. Receives the presentation received from Ruby Mekker regarding the health hazards related to wind turbine; and
- 2. That a letter will be drafted and distributed to the regional officers of health that apply to the member municipalities to seek clarification from about whether industrial wind turbines are or should be considered a "health hazard" as defined by the Health Protection and Promotion Act of Ontario, something "that has or

that is likely to have an adverse effect on the health of any person.

**Carried** 

### 7.2 Update on Dover Chatham Kent Water - Ruby Mekker

Ms. Mekker made a presentation to the Working Group regarding the All-Hazard Investigation of Well Water in Chatham-Kent.

Members of the Working Group discussed the legal implications that have come from this investigation.

Subsequent to further discussion, the Working Group passed the following resolution:

#### MMWTWG-2022-42

**Moved by:** Alex Westerhout -

Municipality of Central

Huron

**Seconded by:** Mark Davis - Municipality of

Arran-Elderslie

Be It Resolved that the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby receives the presentation made by Ruby Mekker regarding the all hazard investigation of well water in Chatham Kent for information.

Carried

# 7.3 Update of on IESO - Warren Howard

Mr. Howard provided an update on the IESO.

He highlighted some of the major changes in the electricity sector:

- Demand to grow at 1.7% per annum between 2023 and 2042.
- Driven by electrification -electric vehicles, steelmaking, rail transit and hydrogen.
- New capacity required by 2025.
- Extending the life of the Pickering Plant until 2026.

Warren also provided an update on the ministerial directive issued for the procurement of additional MW.

These projects require "municipal permits or other support from the municipality".

Wind Concerns Ontario has provided their input on Municipal Support Form.

## Specifics on New Project

- Project description and list/map of properties used
- Description of any proposed use road allowances
- Report on Community Engagement Meeting

## Linked to Existing Project

- Relationship between projects and confirmation project is meeting approval terms.
- Confirmation that 40 dBA limit will be met after repowering.
- Details on complaints received about existing project and actions taken to correct the cause.

Wind Concerns Ontario also provided their input on Community Engagement

- Provide same detailed information to community as to the municipality.
- Structure meeting as a "Town Hall".
- Document compliance with any current approval.
- Provide written responses to concerns raised in community meetings.
- Document adjustments made to project based on community feedback.

Wind Concerns Ontario also provided some general feedback regarding the RFP process.

# Indigenous Support

 Local Indigenous support required before points can be awarded for Indigenous participation

#### Double-Dipping

 Storage contracts linked to wind turbine operators require renegotiation of wind contract

#### Municipal Support

- Can only be provided by resolution of the Council for the municipality
- Input from municipal planners and building permits do not indicate municipal support.

Mr. Howard also added that the list of qualified bidders for the expedited process and LT1 RFP was released on August 25. 19 of the approved bidders have wind turbine contracts, and 12 of the 19 are in violation of their existing approval. i.e. noise audits and/or complaint handling.

Chair Allwood thanked Mr. Howard for his presentation,

Subsequent to further discussion, the Working Group passed the following resolution:

#### MMWTWG-2022-43

**Moved by:** Steve Adams - Municipality

of Brockton

**Seconded by:** Randy Roppel -

Municipality of Kincardine

Be It resolved that the Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby receives the presentation made by Mr. Howard for information purposes.

Carried

## 8. Correspondence

# 8.1 Requiring Action

8.1.1 Freedom of Information Request Estimate Letter

The fee estimate was received for the MECP FOI Reference A2022-01938 related to: All summaries, reports, memoranda, notes of meetings and telephone calls, and emails related to accidents or incidents ("catastrophic failures") and fires occurring in wind turbines or wind power generators in Ontario.

It is estimated that the cost to research this request will be \$847.50, 50% of which is required to be paid in advance of the research commencing. A second request was made for information related to the Skyway 8 project. The cost is expected to be under the threshold for an estimate to be required. Any records found will be provided once available

Subsequent to further discussion, the Working Group passed the following resolution:

#### MMWTWG-2022-44

**Moved by:** Steve Adams - Municipality

of Brockton

**Seconded by:** Philip M. Englishman -

Citizen - - Municipality of

Brockton

Be It Resolved that the Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby approves the fee estimate related to MECP FOI Reference A2022-01938 and directs the Recording Secretary to complete payment and proceed.

Carried

8.1.2 Approval of Recording Secretary Invoice

The Working Group passed the following resolution:

MMWTWG-2022-45

**Moved by:** Mark Davis - Municipality of

Arran-Elderslie

**Seconded by:** Alex Westerhout -

Municipality of Central

Huron

Be It Resolved that the Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby approves payment of the invoice for Recording Secretary services for the months of September and October, 2022.

Carried

#### 8.2 For Information

8.2.1 Chatham Kent Water Wells All Hazards Investigation Public Meeting Notice

The Working Group passed the following resolution:

MMWTWG-2022-46

**Moved by:** Paul McQueen -

Municipality of Grey

Highlands

**Seconded by:** Steve Adams - Municipality

of Brockton

Be It resolved that the Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby accepts the correspondence 8.2.1 for information purposes.

Carried

### 9. Members Updates

Bill Palmer noted that he has been accepted for membership into the Institute of Noise Control Engineers - USA and have submitted to their "Noise Control and Engineering Journal" a technical paper titled "Annoyance predicted by objective assessment of wind turbine acoustic profile." It is based on data collected in Bruce and Huron Counties over the last several years. If the paper is accepted, he will provide a presentation to the Working Group at a future meeting.

#### 10. New Business

## 10.1 MMWTWG Members as of October 24th Municipal Election

Members of the Working Group discussed the important mandates that the member municipalities need to continue to advocate for.

The Recording Secretary will draft and forward a letter to the new councils of the Member Municipalities highlighting the work that the MMWTWG has complete and continues to work towards. The Members also agreed that it was important to continue to build an alliance with local provincial government members and that perhaps MPP Rick Byers and Lisa Thompson could be invited to a future meeting.

The members discussed the history of the MMWTWG and how it was established. It was noted that Arran-Elderslie Member Mark Davis has played an important role in the ongoing advocacy of the group. The Member's agreed that his continued membership as a citizen member would be beneficial. The Recording Secretary will pass this information along to Arran-Elderslie for consideration during committee appointments.

Bill Palmer, Citizen Member for the Municipality of Arran-Elderslie, noted his intention to not be re-appointed as a voting member but rather be appointed as a technical advisor to the Working Group. This arrangement would satisfy the requirements he must meet to ensure compliance with this designation as a Professional Engineer.

Subsequent to further discussion, the Working Group passed the following resolution:

#### MMWTWG-2022-47

**Moved by:** Paul McQueen -

Municipality of Grey

Highlands

**Seconded by:** Steve Adams - Municipality

of Brockton

Be It Resolved that the Multi Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group hereby,

- 1. Appoints Bill Palmer as technical advisor to the Working Group in the capacity of Professional Engineer, in accordance with the Terms of Reference; and
- 2. Agrees to pay Mr. Palmer the sum of \$2.00 per annum to compensate him for his technical advice; and
- Acknowledges that Mr. Palmer has satisfied the requirement to retain liability insurance for his advisory role, of which, confirmation will be provided to the Recording Secretary; and
- 4. That this resolution be forwarded to member municipalities of the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group.

Carried

### 11. Closed Session (if required)

Not required.

- 12. Resolution to Reconvene in Open Session
- 13. Adoption of Recommendations Arising from Closed Session (If Any)
- 14. Adoption of Closed Session Minutes
- 15. Confirmation of Next Meeting

The next meeting is scheduled for January 12, 2022.

# 16. Adjournment

The	Working	Group	passed	the	following	resolution:
-----	---------	-------	--------	-----	-----------	-------------

#### MMWTWG-2022-48

**Moved by:** Paul McQueen -

Municipality of Grey

Highlands

Seconded by: Philip M. Englishman -

Citizen - - Municipality of

Brockton

Be it Resolved that the meeting of the Multi-Municipal Wind Turbine Working Group is hereby adjourned at 8:38 p.m.

Carried

Tom Allwood, Chair	Julie Hamilton, Recording Secretary